

**UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT  
FOR THE NORTHERN DISTRICT OF ALABAMA  
SOUTHERN DIVISION**

STATE OF ALABAMA, et al.,

Plaintiffs,

v.

UNITED STATES DEPARTMENT  
OF COMMERCE, et al.,

Defendants,

DIANA MARTINEZ, et al.,

Defendant-Intervenors,

and

COUNTY OF SANTA CLARA,  
CALIFORNIA, et al.,

Defendant-Intervenors.

Case No.: 2:18-cv-00772-RDP

**OPPOSED MOTION FOR LEAVE  
TO INTERVENE AS  
DEFENDANTS  
(Fed. R. Civ. P. 24)**

Proposed Defendant-Intervenors the States of New York, California, Colorado, Connecticut, the District of Columbia, Illinois, Massachusetts, Minnesota, Nevada, New Jersey, New Mexico, Oregon, Rhode Island, Vermont, Virginia, and Washington; the cities and counties of Cameron County, Texas; Central Falls, Rhode Island; Chicago, Illinois; Hidalgo County, Texas; Monterey County, California; New York, New York; Philadelphia, Pennsylvania; Providence, Rhode Island; and Seattle, Washington; and the United States Conference of Mayors, respectfully request that the Court grant them leave to intervene as defendants in this action as of right pursuant to Rule 24(a)(2) of the Federal Rules of Civil Procedure, or in the

alternative, grant them permissive intervention pursuant to Rule 24(b)(1)(B) of the Federal Rules of Civil Procedure. Before filing this motion, counsel for the Proposed Defendant-Intervenors contacted the existing parties to determine their position on this motion to intervene. Plaintiff the State of Alabama and Plaintiff Representative Brooks have indicated that they oppose this motion to intervene. The Federal Defendants have advised that they take no position on this motion. The Martinez Defendant-Intervenors and the Local Government Defendant-Intervenors do not oppose intervention.

In support of this motion, the Proposed Defendant-Intervenors rely on the accompanying Memorandum of Law, the Proposed Answer filed with this motion in compliance with Fed. R. Civ. P. 24(c), the pleadings and papers on file in this action, and any argument and evidence that is presented on the hearing of this motion.

DATED: August 12, 2019

Respectfully submitted,

LETITIA JAMES  
*Attorney General of the State of New York*

/s/ Joyce White Vance  
Joyce White Vance  
101 Paul W. Bryant Drive  
Tuscaloosa, AL 35487  
jvance@law.ua.edu

By: /s/ Matthew Colangelo  
Matthew Colangelo\*  
*Chief Counsel for Federal Initiatives*  
Elena Goldstein,\* *Senior Trial Counsel*  
Elizabeth Morgan\*  
*Assistant Attorney General*

/s/ Barry A. Ragsdale  
Barry A. Ragsdale  
SIROTE & PERMUTT, PC  
2311 Highland Avenue South  
Birmingham, AL 35205  
Phone: (205) 930-5100  
Fax: (205) 930-5101  
bragsdale@sirote.com

Ajay Saini,\* *Assistant Attorney General*  
Office of the New York State Attorney General  
28 Liberty Street  
New York, NY 10005  
Phone: (212) 416-6057  
Matthew.Colangelo@ag.ny.gov  
*Attorneys for the State of New York*

XAVIER BECERRA  
*Attorney General of California*

/s/ Gabrielle D. Boutin  
Gabrielle D. Boutin\*  
*Deputy Attorney General*  
Anthony R. Hakl  
*Supervising Deputy Attorney General*  
R. Matthew Wise, *Deputy Attorney General*  
California Department of Justice  
1300 I Street, Suite 125  
P.O. Box 944255  
Sacramento, CA 94244-2550  
Phone: (916) 210-6053  
Gabrielle.Boutin@doj.ca.gov

*Attorneys for the State of California*

WILLIAM TONG  
*Attorney General of Connecticut*

Mark F. Kohler, *Assistant Attorney General*  
Office of the Attorney General  
55 Elm Street  
P.O. Box 120  
Hartford, CT 06106  
Phone: (860) 808-5020  
Mark.Kohler@ct.gov

*Attorneys for the State of Connecticut*

PHILIP J. WEISER  
*Attorney General of the State of Colorado*

Eric R. Olson, *Solicitor General*  
1300 Broadway, 10th Floor  
Denver, CO 80203  
Phone: (720) 508-6548  
eric.olson@coag.gov

*Attorneys for the State of Colorado*

KARL A. RACINE  
*Attorney General for the District of Columbia*

Valerie M. Nannery  
*Assistant Attorney General*  
Public Advocacy Division  
Office of the Attorney General for the District  
of Columbia  
441 4th Street, N.W., Suite 630 South  
Washington, DC 20001  
Phone: (202) 724-6610  
valerie.nannery@dc.gov

*Attorneys for the District of Columbia*

**KWAME RAOUL**

*Attorney General of the State of Illinois*

Jeff VanDam, *Public Interest Counsel*  
Office of the Illinois Attorney General  
100 West Randolph Street, 12th Floor  
Chicago, IL 60601  
Phone: (312) 814-1188  
JVanDam@atg.state.il.us

*Attorneys for the State of Illinois*

**KEITH ELLISON**

*Attorney General of the State of Minnesota*

Jacob Campion, *Assistant Attorney General*  
Office of the Minnesota Attorney General  
445 Minnesota Street, Suite 1100  
St. Paul, MN 55101-2128  
Phone: (651) 757-1459  
jacob.campion@ag.state.mn.us

*Attorneys for the State of Minnesota*

**GURBIR S. GREWAL**

*Attorney General of the State of New Jersey*

Glenn J. Moramarco  
*Assistant Attorney General*  
Katherine A. Gregory  
*Deputy Attorney General*  
Office of the Attorney General  
Richard J. Hughes Justice Complex  
25 Market Street, 8th Floor, West Wing  
Trenton, NJ 08625-0080  
Phone: (609) 292-4925  
Glenn.Moramarco@law.njoag.gov

*Attorneys for the State of New Jersey*

**MAURA HEALEY**

*Attorney General of the Commonwealth of Massachusetts*

By: /s/ Ann E. Lynch

Ann E. Lynch,\* *Assistant Attorney General*  
Miranda Cover,\* *Assistant Attorney General*  
Public Protection & Advocacy Bureau  
Massachusetts Attorney General's Office  
One Ashburton Place  
Boston, MA 02108  
Phone: (617) 727-2200  
Ann.lynch@mass.gov

*Attorneys for the Commonwealth of Massachusetts*

**AARON D. FORD**

*Attorney General of the State of Nevada*

Heidi Parry Stern, *Solicitor General*  
Office of the Nevada Attorney General  
555 E. Washington Ave., Ste. 3900  
Las Vegas, NV 89101  
Phone: (775) 684-1100  
HStern@ag.nv.gov

*Attorneys for the State of Nevada*

**HECTOR BALDERAS**

*Attorney General of New Mexico*

Tania Maestas

*Chief Deputy Attorney General*  
Nicholas M. Sydow, *Civil Appellate Chief*  
Jennie Lusk  
*Bureau Chief, Civil Rights Bureau*  
408 Galisteo Street  
Santa Fe, NM 87501  
Phone: (505) 490-4060  
tmaestas@nmag.gov

*Attorneys for the State of New Mexico*

ELLEN F. ROSENBLUM  
*Attorney General of the State of Oregon*

Nicole deFever  
Scott Kaplan  
    *Senior Assistant Attorney General*  
Oregon Department of Justice  
1162 Court Street NE  
Salem, OR 97301  
Phone: (971) 673-1800  
Nicole.defever@doj.state.or.us

*Attorneys for the State of Oregon*

THOMAS J. DONOVAN, JR.  
*Attorney General of the State of Vermont*

Benjamin D. Battles, *Solicitor General*  
Julio A. Thompson  
    *Assistant Attorney General, Civil Rights Unit*  
Office of the Vermont Attorney General  
109 State Street  
Montpelier, VT 05609-1001  
Phone: (802) 828-5500  
Benjamin.Battles@vermont.gov

*Attorneys for the State of Vermont*

ROBERT W. FERGUSON  
*Attorney General of the State of Washington*

Laura K. Clinton, *Assistant Attorney General*  
Andrew R. W. Hughes  
    *Assistant Attorney General*  
Complex Litigation Division  
800 Fifth Avenue, Suite 2000  
Seattle, WA 98104  
Phone: (206) 233-3383  
LauraC5@atg.wa.gov

*Attorneys for the State of Washington*

PETER F. NERONHA  
*Attorney General of the State of Rhode Island*

Justin Sullivan  
    *Special Assistant Attorney General*  
150 South Main Street  
Providence, RI 02903  
Phone: (401) 274-4400  
jjsullivan@riag.ri.gov

*Attorneys for the State of Rhode Island*

MARK R. HERRING  
*Attorney General of the Commonwealth of Virginia*

Michelle S. Kallen, *Deputy Solicitor General*  
Toby J. Heytens, *Solicitor General*  
Martine E. Cicconi, *Deputy Solicitor General*  
Brittany M. Jones, *John Marshall Fellow*  
Office of the Attorney General  
202 North Ninth Street  
Richmond, VA 23219  
Phone: (804) 786-7240  
SolicitorGeneral@oag.state.va.us

*Attorneys for the Commonwealth of Virginia*

MATTHEW JERZYK  
*City Solicitor for the City of Central Falls*  
City of Central Falls  
580 Broad Street  
Central Falls, RI 02863  
Phone: (401) 727-7422  
MJerzyk@CentralFallsRI.us

*Attorney for the City of Central Falls*

**MARK A. FLESSNER**  
*Corporation Counsel of the City of Chicago*

Stephen Kane, *Deputy Corporation Counsel*  
Rebecca Hirsch, *Assistant Corporation  
Counsel*  
City of Chicago Law Department  
Affirmative Litigation Division  
121 N. LaSalle Street, Room 600  
Chicago, IL 60602  
Phone: (312) 744-6934  
Stephen.kane@cityofchicago.org

*Attorneys for the City of Chicago*

**MARCEL S. PRATT**  
*City Solicitor of the City of Philadelphia*

Benjamin H. Field  
*Divisional Deputy City Solicitor*  
City of Philadelphia Law Department  
1515 Arch Street, 17th Floor  
Philadelphia, PA 19102  
Phone: (215) 683-5003  
marcel.pratt@phila.gov

*Attorneys for the City of Philadelphia*

**PETER S. HOLMES**  
*Seattle City Attorney*

Gary T. Smith, *Assistant City Attorney*  
Erica R. Franklin, *Assistant City Attorney*  
701 Fifth Avenue, Suite 2050  
Seattle, WA 98104-7097  
Phone: (206) 684-8200  
Gary.Smith@seattle.gov

*Attorneys for the City of Seattle*

**ZACHARY W. CARTER**  
*Corporation Counsel of the City of New York*

Tonya Jenerette  
*Deputy Chief for Strategic Litigation*  
100 Church Street  
New York, NY 10007  
Phone: (212) 356-4055  
tjeneret@law.nyc.gov

*Attorneys for the City of New York*

**JEFFREY DANA**  
*City Solicitor of the City of Providence*  
City of Providence  
444 Westminster Street  
Providence, RI 02903  
Phone: (401) 680-5333  
Jdana@providdenceri.gov

*Attorney for the City of Providence*

**ROLANDO L. RIOS**  
*Special Counsel for Cameron and Hidalgo  
Counties*  
110 Broadway, Suite 355  
San Antonio, TX 78205  
Phone: (210) 222-2102  
rios@rolandorioslaw.com

*Attorney for Cameron County, Texas and  
Hidalgo County, Texas*

CHARLES J. McKEE  
*Monterey County Counsel*

William M. Litt, *Deputy County Counsel*  
Office of the County Counsel  
County of Monterey  
168 West Alisal Street, 3rd Floor  
Salinas, CA 93901  
Phone: (831) 755-5045  
McKeeCJ@co.monterey.ca.us

*Attorneys for Monterey County*

UNITED STATES CONFERENCE OF  
MAYORS

John Daniel Reaves, *General Counsel*  
U.S. Conference of Mayors  
1750 K Street NW, 11th Floor  
Washington, DC 20006  
Phone: (202) 887-1100  
jdreavesoffice@gmail.com

*Attorney for the U.S. Conference of Mayors*

*\*Application for admission pro hac vice forthcoming*

**CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE**

I hereby certify that on this 12th day of August, 2019, I electronically filed the foregoing Motion for Leave to Intervene as Defendants, a supporting Memorandum of Law, and a proposed Answer in Intervention with the Clerk of the District Court using the CM/ECF system, which will send notification of such filing to all counsel of record in this proceeding.

I also hereby certify that I have caused to be mailed by First Class Mail the document to the following non-CM/ECF participant:

Representative Morris J. Brooks, Jr.  
2101 W. Clinton Ave.  
Suite 302  
Huntsville, AL 35805

DATED: August 12, 2019

/s/ Barry A. Ragsdale  
Barry A. Ragsdale  
SIROTE & PERMUTT, PC  
2311 Highland Avenue South  
Birmingham, AL 35205  
Phone: (205) 930-5100  
Fax: (205) 930-5101  
bragsdale@sirote.com